
Teresa M. Mares
Your article is protected by copyright and all rights are held exclusively by Springer Science +Business Media New York. This e-offprint is for personal use only and shall not be self-archived in electronic repositories. If you wish to self-archive your article, please use the accepted manuscript version for posting on your own website. You may further deposit the accepted manuscript version in any repository, provided it is only made publicly available 12 months after official publication or later and provided acknowledgement is given to the original source of publication and a link is inserted to the published article on Springer’s website. The link must be accompanied by the following text: “The final publication is available at link.springer.com”.
Reading *Seeds of Resistance, Seeds of Hope* while Vermont became the first state in the nation to mandate the labeling of genetically modified organisms (GMOs) brought special poignancy to the arguments it presents. Composed of 12 chapters on topics ranging from the conservation of potato varieties in the Andes to the cultural significance of corn for the Zapatistas of Chiapas, Mexico, this edited volume serves as both an intellectual intervention against the ongoing march of genetic homogeneity and a call to celebrate the millions of backyard seed savers around the globe who are resisting these same forces. United by an exploration of the concepts of conservation practiced *in situ*, *ex situ*, and *in vivo*, the authors in this volume draw particular attention to the ways that place is enacted, sustained, and reshaped through the agency of growers (and eaters) throughout time and across space. This weaving together of the history, present, and the future of sustaining biodiversity is perhaps the strongest quality of this volume, and a testament to its likely continued relevance.

In the introductory chapter “Temptation to Hope: From the ‘Idea’ to the Milieu of Biodiversity,” Nazarea (p.5) argues for the link between diversity of plant genetic resources and diversity of worldviews:

If there is any lesson learned, it is that biodiversity flourishes under conditions of marginality, hand in hand with memories that enliven culinary and healing traditions, as well as reciprocity and commensality. Hence, allowing spaces for traditional ways of life to prosper *in vivo* as viable alternatives to global monocultures of capitalism and consumerism is even more imperative than the collection of germplasm and codification of traditional knowledge in genebanks and archives.

This statement holds special relevance for me as a cultural anthropologist and bolsters the argument for a transdisciplinary approach to studying food systems that integrates a fine tuned analysis of both natural and cultural worlds. In particular, the chapters by Gonzales (Chapter 4), Fueres *et al.* (- Chapter 5), and Brown (Chapter 7), highlight the significance of the cosmologies of indigenous communities wherein humans and their often edible surroundings are related through bonds of kinship, spiritual reverence, and respect, rather than separation and domination.

Perhaps the most remarkable quality of this volume is the diversity of its authors, not only across academic disciplines but also across institutional sectors. Comprised of anthropologists, public school teachers, apple enthusiasts, political ecologists, NGO directors, and leaders of peasant unions (among others), they present work from a variety of cultural perspectives, from the outside looking in, and the inside looking out. This diversity of backgrounds makes for a refreshing read, and allows one to consider the central themes of this volume from multiple angles and degrees of cultural familiarity. This also reveals a crucial, though subtle, political and epistemological claim of the volume, namely that insiders and community members have as much to say about conservation efforts as do the assumed “expert” outsiders trained in western ways of knowing. While several authors reinforce this argument throughout the volume, the way the overall collection serves to flatten out epistemological hierarchy could be discussed more deliberately by the editors in the introduction, or perhaps through an extended conclusion that draws together the claims and themes more...
fully. As the volume is organized into two parts, “Marginality and Memory in Place-Based Conservation” and “Agency and Reterritorialization in the Context of Globalization,” with no fully-formed conclusion, future editions of this volume might include some summary thoughts and reflections that bring together these two parts and outline areas of future scholarship and action.

While it is clear that each chapter was carefully prepared, selected, and edited, four receive special attention in this review for their originality of approach, topic, or use of voice. In chapter five, “Saving Our Seeds: An Indigenous Perspective from Cotacachi, Ecuador,” Magdalene Fueres, Rodrigo Flores, and Rosita Ramos, all leaders of the Union of Peasant and Indigenous Organizations of Cotacachi, discuss their experiences developing and sustaining collaborative development projects guided by the goal of Desarrollando con Identidad (Development with Identity), and the ongoing threats posted by the loss of ancestral knowledge. One of the efforts they describe is a program where indigenous children of the region receive scholarships to collect agricultural knowledge from their parents and grandparents as they also collect seeds that are planted in a communal biodiversity garden. These kinds of intergenerational efforts hold much promise in areas where the reach of the global economy has negatively impacted local economic opportunities, indigenous sovereignty, and access to resources. Learning about the successes and challenges of these efforts from cultural insiders is both inspiring and instructive for applied researchers and practitioners.

Chapter six, “People, Place, and Plants in the Pacific Coast of Columbia,” by Juana Camacho from the Instituto Colombiano de Anthropologia e Historia, focuses on Afro-Colombian women and their role in in situ conservation. Drawing upon bell hooks’ concept of “homeplace,” Camacho presents a decidedly feminist exploration of the struggles women endure to survive, if not thrive, amidst histories of violence, subjugation, and war. She argues “…in a context of indentured slavery, adaptation to the tropical rainforest, and structural exclusion, black women’s environmental knowledge and social practices have contributed to the reconstruction of the social and cultural fabric and to the defense of place and culture. Yet their social and environmental knowledge and practices remain invisible to the public eye” (2013:116). Camacho marries together deep ethnographic insight with a detailed agroecological account, including in her chapter pages of tables of plant species grown in these communities, their origins, and their uses. Her exploration of gendered space, including how and when men and women access and utilize natural alimentary and medicinal resources, is a significant contribution to the scholarship on biodiversity and a reminder that social and economic marginalization stem from a layered and intersectional set of processes and inequalities. As importantly, she reminds the reader of the resiliency of these women as they inhabit and reclaim the margins.

In a similar treatise on resiliency, “Maya Mother Seeds in Resistance of Highland Chiapas in Defense of Native Corn” (Chapter 7), Peter Brown documents the impressive efforts of the Zapatistas and their allies to defend indigenous corn against contamination of transgenic varieties. Brown movingly describes both the seed banking efforts of Mother Seeds in Resistance and their “grow-out” efforts wherein the seeds of indigenous varieties of corn from this region are sent to communities around the world to grow in solidarity with the autonomous efforts of the EZLN. Following on the heels of the discovery of GM-contaminated corn in the neighboring state of Oaxaca, the Zapatistas and their supporters have aligned their protection of landrace seeds with claims of autonomy over land, resources, and indigenous forms of governance, a truly grassroots declaration of seed sovereignty. Brown’s examination of these claims is both celebratory and questioning: “Would the myriad peoples fighting GMOs look beyond the ski masks and occasional militaristic nods toward Latin American revolutionary culture to offer desperately needed support for the Zapatistas?” In these final words to his chapter, we are reminded of the need for cross-border alliances and scaled-up social movements.

Kristine Skarbø’s chapter “Situated Meanings of Key Concepts in the Regulation of Plant Genetic Resources” is perhaps the volume’s most methodologically innovative and instructive piece, detailing her work with photovoice projects among different stakeholders involved in potato conservation efforts in Peru. Though photovoice has an established history in many community-based and applied research approaches, Skarbø’s piece is significant for the depth of understanding it provides on the actual field practices and analytical techniques used to better understand how diverse actors understand, define, and relate to key terms (e.g., “rights,” “benefits,” and “biodiversity”) with often divergent and culturally-informed meanings. For researchers interested in producing results relevant in policy circles and supporting regulatory change, Skarbø reminds us that texts are interpreted in multiple ways and that implementing these texts must consider these different interpretations. Field-based photovoice projects hold particular promise for unearthing these various interpretations and may be particularly useful in communities with literacy challenges or barriers.

The broad reach of this volume and the transdisciplinary composition of its authors make it a relevant and timely read for students and educators across academic disciplines and groups of practitioners. Taken together or separately, the chapters would serve an introductory course in environmental anthropology class as well as an advanced graduate seminar on research methodologies or social theory. Further, this book would appeal to the casual seed saver looking to expand her knowledge of indigenous food systems or to the conservation
fieldworker seeking to contextualize his personal experiences within the broader political-economic and regulatory environment related to plant genetic resources. As we collectively move forward with our efforts to recognize, document, and protect a diversity of seeds, plants, and ways of knowing, this volume reminds us that we are interdependent, both with other humans and with the places we inhabit.